

MEMORY POLITICS IN POST-TOTALITARIAN SOCIETIES THE CASE OF CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE

Ludmila Cojocari, dr.
“ProMemoria” Institute of Social History
Moldova State University

Course overview (32 hours)

After dramatic transformations of the 1989/91, the attention of European societies was redirected toward studying and understanding of old regimes’ historical legacy. The end of cold war and liberation from Soviet authority encouraged approaching the painful process of confronting long-buried pages from recent history, whether crimes committed during the Second World War or traumatic episodes associated with decades of Communist rule.

This course aims to examine the memory politics in the Central and East-European societies in order to understand the problems and challenges of coming to terms with the traumatic post-totalitarian legacy and to analyze the memory practices involved by the state and society toward the aim of reconciliation. Through the concept of memory politics, the course is focused on the strategies, practices, and rituals of past’s revisiting and reassessing: What are the main approaches of memory studies regarding the post-conflict societies? What are the main issues of memory politics at the level of community, region, nation that lead to systematic remembering or/and forgetting? Which commemorative practices are most appropriated to the process of reconciliation at the level of community, region, and nation? What persists in collective memory that resists historical and ideological interpretations? How and why do sites of collective memory acquire emotional and political importance and how to use them in reaching reconciliation and democracy building in the countries with a totalitarian legacy?

The course will introduce students to critical perspectives on memory politics in the post-totalitarian societies through readings, discussions, and small research projects (case studies). Case studies will be used to examine memory as an active process of official and public reconstruction - a process in which multiple representations about the past contend for recognition, for moral judgment, and emotional impact. The comparative dimension of the analysed case studies will emphasize the constructed nature of memory, mainly expressed in rituals, practices, and attitudes of different communities of memory.

Upon completion of the course, students will be able to:

- Understand main theoretical and methodological approaches in the field of memory studies;
- Undertake a critical analysis of the relationship between theory and practice in dealing with problems of politics of memory in the post-conflict societies;
- Analyze problems related to the traumatized experience of the post-totalitarian societies and to identify the appropriate strategies and policies toward national reconciliation;
- Apply theories and research methods of studying the memory of totalitarian societies to a wide range of problems arising in the contemporary societies that are undergoing dramatic transformations.

Course evaluation:

- 25 % - weekly critical essays (1 page each);
- 25% - weekly class participation and guiding one seminar discussion;
- 20% - memory study (3 pages);
- 30% - final term paper (10-12 pages).

Weekly critical essays (one page, due each week): The critical essays are presented each week and aim to help students prepare for seminar and develop their skills of critical thinking and equidistant original approach. The essay will start with a brief statement of the main argument(s) of the reading materials and will be developed by student's reflections on her/his own critics and arguments: What is the aim of the reading? How well did the author accomplish her/his intentions? How does it reflect and shape larger trends of discussion in the field of memory studies and memory politics/policies? What questions does it raise for some concrete case/country?

One seminar discussion (choose a week to present): Each student will take a turn presenting a week of readings during the semester (the date will be chosen from the course schedule at the end of 1st class meeting). It assumes to prepare a handout with discussion questions for the class and any additional information to support discussion. Student's task is to frame the discussion and get audience started with a presentation of 10-15 minutes at the beginning of class. The preparations might expand student's own reading for this week by bringing in other literature or might encouraged looking up book reviews or other works that cite or make use of the readings at hand. Strategies to help the class achieve the goals of connecting the week's reading to previous readings, to larger intellectual trends within and/or outside the problem of memory politics are strongly encouraged.

Memory study (three pages, due at the end of the 4th meeting): This is a practice exercise in doing a study in the field of collective memory. The students will pick a memory site they will visit and write field notes on active/passive observation, looking at the mnemonic landscape and thinking about the place from the perspective of realm of memory. The brief text of 3 (three) double-spaced pages should describe the realm of memory and present toward class audience. The study will include a brief evaluation of methodologies used or considered to be used for a longer research project. This memory study can serve as a point of departure for final term paper.

Final term paper (due last class days): The final term paper (approximately 10-12 pages, double-spaced, 12-pt. font, 1-inch margins, text only) should engage a number of the theoretical perspectives and empirical problems that have formed the foundation for this class. Students are encouraged to develop the topic they explored in early elaborated memory study, but they are also welcome to connect these themes to their own dissertation or thesis research. During one of the last two class meetings a brief presentation of 15-20 minutes on the results of research/writing efforts will be presented.

The main topics

- Collective memory studies: theories, concepts, research methods
- Post-conflict communities of memory: historical contexts and commemorative agencies
- Approaching traumatic past: aims, issues and challenges
- When silenced memory goes public history: struggles and paths to reconciliation
- Memory makers (official & public initiatives): monuments, museums, textbooks, films, anniversaries, memoires etc.
- Making sense of totalitarian past: memory as a form of justice
- Toward a trans-national (European) memory

Topics and Readings

Collective memory studies: theories, concepts, research methods (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Confino, Alon, (1997) *Collective memory and cultural history: problems of method*, in *American Historical Review*, no. 103, 1997, pp. 1386-1404.
- ✓ Halbwachs, Maurice (1980) *The collective memory*, New York: Harper & Row; Хальбвакс, М. (2005) *Коллективная и историческая память*, in *Неприкосновенный запас*, no. 2-3. (<http://magazines.russ.ru/nz/2005/2/ha2.html>)
- ✓ Kaustainer, Wulf (2002) *Finding meaning in memory: a methodological critique of collective memory studies*, in *History and Theory*, vol. 41, 2002, pp. 179-197.
- ✓ Misztal, Barbara A. (2003) *Theories of social remembering*, Buckingham: Open University Press.
- ✓ Olick, Jeffrey et al. (eds.) (2008) *The collective memory reader*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- ✓ Ricoeur, Paul (2004) *Memory, history, forgetting*, Chicago, London: The University of Chicago Press; Рикер, П. (2004) *Память, история, забвение*, Москва: Издательство гуманитарной литературы, pp. 573-630. (<http://ec-dejavu.ru/o/Oblivion.html>)
- ✓ Нора, П. (2005) *Всемирное торжество памяти*, in *Неприкосновенный запас*, no. 2-3. (<http://magazines.russ.ru/nz/2005/2/nora22.html>)

Post-conflict communities of memory: historical contexts and agencies (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Alexander, Jeffrey C. et al. (2004) *Cultural trauma and collective identity*, Berkeley: University of California Press.
- ✓ Connerton, Paul (1989) *How societies remember*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ✓ Herf, Jeffrey (1998) *Divided memory: the Nazi past in the two Germanys*, Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- ✓ Irwin-Zarecka, Iwona (2007) *Frames of remembrance: the dynamics of collective memory*, New Brunswick, N.J.: Transaction Publishers. (pp. 47-66 on “communities of memory”)
- ✓ Lorey, David E. and William H. Beezley (eds), (2002) *Genocide, collective violence, and popular memory: the politics of remembrance in the twentieth century*, Wilmington: SR Books.
- ✓ Passerini, Luisa (1992) *Introduction*, in *Memory and totalitarianism*, L. Passerini (ed.), vol. 1, *International Yearbook of Oral History and Life Stories*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 1-20.
- ✓ Wertsch, James V. (1998) *Voices of collective remembering*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Approaching traumatic past: aims, issues and challenges (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Adorno, Theodore (1986) *What does coming to terms with the past mean? in Bitburg in moral and political perspective*, G. Hartman (ed.), Bloomington: Indiana University Press./ Адорно, Теодор (2005) *Что значит "проработка прошлого"*, in *Неприкосновенный запас*, no. 2-3 (40-41). (<http://magazines.russ.ru/nz/2005/2/ado4-pr.html>)
- ✓ Caruth, Cathy (2006) *Unclaimed experience: trauma, narrative, and history*, Johns Hopkins University Press.
- ✓ Hutton, Patrick (2004) *Memories of trauma: problems of interpretation*, in *History and Theory*, vol. 43, pp. 249-259.
- ✓ Kirmayer, Laurence J. et al. (eds) (2007) *Understanding trauma: integrating biological, clinical, and cultural perspectives*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ✓ LaCapra, Dominick (2001) *Writing history, writing trauma*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

- ✓ White, Hayden (1992) *Historical emplotment and the problem of truth*, in *Probing the limits of representation. Nazism and the "final solution"*, S. Friedländer (ed.), Cambridge: Harvard University Press, pp. 37-53.
- ✓ Хёслер, Иоахим (2005) *Что значит "проработка прошлого"? Об историографии Великой Отечественной войны в СССР и России*, in *Неприкосновенный запас*, no. 2-3 (40-41). (<http://magazines.russ.ru/nz/2005/2/he10-pr.html>)

When silenced memory goes public history: struggles and paths to reconciliation (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Charbonneau, Bruno, Genevieve Parent (eds) (2011) *Peace-building, memory and reconciliation: bridging top-down and bottom-up approaches*, Rutledge.
- ✓ Glassberg, David (1996) *Public history and the study of memory*, in *The Public Historian*, vol. 18, pp. 7-23.
- ✓ Kaminski, Marek M. & Monika Nalepa (2006) *Judging transitional justice: a new criterion for evaluating truth revelation procedures*, in *The Journal of Conflict Resolution*, vol. 50, no. 3, Transitional Justice, pp. 383-408.
- ✓ Kean, Hilda (2010) *People, historians, and public history: demystifying the process of history making*, in *The Public Historian*, vol. 32(3), pp. 25-38.

Memory makers (official & public): monuments, museums, textbooks, anniversaries, films, memoires etc. (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Crane, Susan A. (ed.) (2000) *Museums and memory*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- ✓ Karp, Ivan and Steven D. Lavine (eds) (1990) *Exhibiting cultures: the politics and poetics of museum display*, Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press.
- ✓ King, Alex (2001) *Remembering and forgetting in the public memorials of the Great War*, in *The art of forgetting*, A. Forty and S. Kuchler (eds), New York: Berg, pp. 147-170.
- ✓ Koonz, Claudia (1994) *Between Memory and oblivion: concentration camps in German memory*, in *Commemorations: the politics of national identity*, J. R. Gillis (ed.), Princeton: Princeton University Press, pp. 258-80.
- ✓ Prost, Antoine (1996) *Monuments to the dead*, in *Realms of memory: rethinking the French*, P. Nora (ed.), translated by A. Goldhammer, vol. 2, New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 307-32.
- ✓ Rodell, Magnus (2005) *Monuments and the places of memory*, in *Memory work: the theory and practice of memory*, A. Kitzmann et al. (eds), Lang, pp. 105-130.

Making sense of totalitarian past: memory as a form of justice (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Amstutz, Mark A. (2005) *The healing of nations. The promise and limits of political forgiveness*, Rowman & Littlefield, pp. 41-91).
- ✓ Bloomfield, David et al. (2005) *Reconciliation after violent conflict*, Stockholm: International IDEA. (http://www.idea.int/conflict/reconciliation/reconciliation_full.pdf)
- ✓ Brito, Alexandra Barahona de et al. (eds) (2002) *The politics of memory: transitional justice in democratizing societies*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- ✓ Geyer, Michael, Fitzpatrick, Sheila (eds) (2008) *Beyond totalitarianism. Stalinism and Nazism compared*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- ✓ Langenohl, Andreas (2008) *Memory in post-authoritarian societies*, in *Cultural memory studies: an international and interdisciplinary handbook (Media and cultural memory)*, A. Erll and A. Nünning (eds), Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, pp. 163-172.

- ✓ Rousso, Henry (2002) *The haunting past: history, memory, and justice in contemporary France*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Toward a trans-national (European) memory (4 hours)

Reading list:

- ✓ Echterkamp, Jörg, Stefan Martens (eds) (2010) *Experience and memory: the Second World War in Europe (Contemporary European History)*, Berghahn Books, 2010.
- ✓ Garton Ash, Timothy (2002) *Trials, purges and history lessons: treating a difficult past in post-communist Europe*, in *Memory and Power in Post-War Europe Studies in the Presence of the Past*, J.-W. Müller (ed.), Oxford: All Souls College, pp. 265-282.
- ✓ Judt, Tony (2002) *The past is another country: myth and memory in post-war Europe*, in *Memory and Power in Post-War Europe Studies in the Presence of the Past*, J.-W. Müller (ed.), Oxford: All Souls College, pp. 157-183.
- ✓ Pakier, Magorzata, Bo Stråth (eds) (2010) *A European Memory? Contested histories and politics of remembrance (Studies in contemporary European history)*, Berghahn Books.

Essay Presentations (4 hours)

Additional readings

1. Bilbija, Ksenija (2005) *The art of truth-telling about authoritarian rule*, Madison, Wis.: University of Wisconsin Press.
2. Boyarin, Jonathan (ed.) (1994) *Remapping memory: the politics of time and space*, Minneapolis, Minn.: University of Minnesota Press.
3. Climo, Jacob and Cattell, Maria G. (2002) *Introduction: Meaning in social memory and history: anthropological perspectives*, in *Social memory and history: anthropological perspectives*, I. Climo and M. Cattell (eds), Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, pp. 1-38.
4. Cohen, Shari J. (1999) *Politics without a past: the absence of history in post-communist nationalism*, Duke University Press, pp. 1-24.
5. Confino, Alon (1997) *Collective memory and cultural history: problems of method*, in *American Historical Review*, vol. 103, pp. 1386-1404.
6. Confino, Alon (2006) *Germany as a culture of remembrance: promises and limits of writing history*, Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
7. Conrad, Sebastian (2003) *Entangled memories*, in *Journal of Contemporary History*, no. 38(1), pp. 85-99.
8. Elster, Jon (2004) *Closing the books: transitional justice in historical perspective*, New York: Cambridge University Press.
9. Eng, David L. (2002) *Loss: the politics of mourning*, University of California Press.
10. Esposito, Elena (2008) *Social forgetting: a systems-theory approach*, in *Cultural memory studies: an international and interdisciplinary handbook (Media and cultural memory)*, A. Erll and A. Nünning (eds), Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, pp. 181-190.
11. Eyal, Gil (2004) *Identity and trauma: two forms of the will to memory*, in *History and Memory*, vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 5-36.
12. Fentress, James (1992) *Social memory*, Oxford, UK; Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, pp. 1-40.
13. Finney, Patrick (2010) *Remembering the road to World War Two: international history, national identity, collective memory*, New York, NY: Routledge.
14. Friedländer, Saul (1991) *Trauma, transference and 'working through' in writing the history of the Shoah*, in *History and Memory*, vol. 4(1), pp. 39-59.
15. Friedlander, Saul (2000) *History, memory, and the historian: dilemmas and responsibilities*, in *New German Critique*, no. 80, pp. 3-15.

16. Geyer, Michael (1996) *The politics of memory in contemporary Germany*, in *Radical evil*, J. Copjec (ed.), Verso, pp. 169-200.
17. Green, Anna (2004) *Individual remembering and 'collective memory': theoretical presuppositions and contemporary debates*, in *Oral History*, vol. 32, no. 2, pp. 35-44.
18. Huyssen, Andreas (1995) *Twilight memories: marking time in a culture of amnesia*, New York: Routledge.
19. Huyssen, Andreas (2000) *Present pasts: media, politics, and amnesia*, in *Public Culture*, no. 12, pp. 21-38.
20. Kansteiner, Wulf and Harald Weilnböck (2008) *Against the concept of cultural trauma*, in *Cultural memory studies: an international and interdisciplinary handbook (Media and cultural memory)*, A. Erll and A. Nünning (eds), Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, pp. 229-240.
21. Klein, Kerwin Lee (2006) *On the emergence of memory in historical discourse*, in *Representations*, no. 69, special issue: Grounds for remembering, pp.127-150.
22. Konesaar, Ene et al. (eds) (2009) *The burden of remembering: recollections and representations of the twentieth century*, Helsinki: Finish Literature Society.
23. Le Goff, Jacques (1992) *History and memory*, New York: Columbia University Press.
24. Letki, Natalia (2002) *Lustration and democratisation in East-Central Europe*, in *Europe-Asia Studies*, vol. 54, no. 4, pp. 529-552.
25. Lind, Jennifer M. (2008) *Sorry states: apologies in international politics*, Cornell Studies in Security Affairs: Cornell University Press.
26. Long, William J. and Peter Brecke (2003) *War and reconciliation: reason and emotion in conflict resolution*, MIT Press.
27. Margalit, Avishai (2002) *Forgiving and forgetting*, in *The ethics of memory*, Harvard University Press, pp. 183-210.
28. Meyer, Erik (2008) *Memory and politics*, in *Cultural memory studies: an international and interdisciplinary handbook (Media and cultural memory)*, A. Erll and A. Nünning (eds), Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, pp. 173-180.
29. Moeller, Robert G. (2005) *Germans as victims?: Thoughts on a post-cold war history of World War II's legacies*, in *History and Memory*, vol. 17, no. 1-2, special issue: Histories and memories of twentieth-century Germany, pp. 145-194.
30. Nora, Pierre (1989) *Between memory and history: les lieux de memoire*, in *Representations*, vol. 26, pp. 7-24.
31. Nora, Pierre (ed.) (1996) *Realms of memory*, New York: Columbia University Press.
32. Olick, Jeffrey K. (2007) *The politics of regret: on collective memory and historical responsibility*, New York: Rutledge.
33. Onken, Eva-Clarita (2007) *The Baltic States and Moscow's 9 May Commemoration: analysing memory politics in Europe*, in *Europe-Asia Studies*, vol. 59, no. 1, pp. 23-46.
34. Pennebaker, James W. et al. (eds) (1997) *Collective memory of political events: social psychological perspectives*, Mahwah, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
35. Radstone, Susannah (2000) *Memory and methodology*, Oxford; New York: Berg.
36. Rappaport, Joanne (1998) *The politics of memory: native historical interpretation in the Colombian Andes*, Durham: Duke University Press.
37. Ricoeur, Paul et al. (eds) (2006) *Memory, history, forgetting*, University of Chicago Press.
38. Rose, Richard (2009) *Understanding post-communist transformation: a bottom up approach*, London; New York: Routledge, 2009
39. Rosenberg, Tina (1995) *The haunted land: facing Europe's ghosts after communism*, Random House.
40. Rousso, Henry (1999) *Stalinisme et nazisme: histoire et mémoire comparées*, Editions Complexe.

41. Shotter, John (1990) *The social construction of remembering and forgetting*, in *Collective remembering*, D. Middleton and E. Derek (eds), London; Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage Publications, pp. 120-138.
42. Trouillot, Michel-Rolph (1995) *Silencing the past: power and the production of history*, Boston, Mass: Beacon Press.
43. Walkowitz, Daniel J. and Lisa Maya Knauer (eds) (2004) *Memory and the impact of political transformation in public space*, Durham: Duke University Press.
44. Wertsch, James V. (2008) *The narrative organization of collective memory*, in *ETHOS*, vol. 36, no. 1, pp. 120-135.
45. White, Geoffrey M. (1997) *Museum, memorial, shrine: national narrative in national spaces*, in *Museum Anthropology*, no. 21(1), pp. 8-27.
46. Winter, Jay M. (1995) *Sites of memory, sites of mourning. The Great War in European cultural history*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
47. Winter, Jay M. (2006) *Notes on the memory boom war, remembrance and the uses of the past*, in *Memory, trauma and world politics: reflections on the relationship between past and present*, D. Bell (ed.), Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 54-73.
48. Winter, Jay M. (2008) *War, memory, and mourning in the twentieth century: notes on the memory boom*, in *The merits of memory. Concepts, contexts, debates*, H.-J. Grabbe, S. Schindler (eds), Heidelberg: Universitätsverlag Winter GmbH, pp. 97-118.
49. Winter, Jay, Emmanuel Sivan (eds) (2000) *War and remembrance*, Cambridge University Press.
50. Young, James E. (1993) *The texture of memory: Holocaust memorials and meaning*, New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press.
51. Арнаутова, Ю. Е. (2003) *Мемориа: «тотальный социальный феномен» и объект исследования*, in *Образы прошлого и коллективная идентичность в Европе до начала Нового времени*, Л. Репина (ed.), Москва: Кругъ, pp. 19-37. [В сокращении: http://ec-dejavu.ru/m/Memory_medieval.html]
52. Васильев, А. (2009) *Мемориализация и забвение как механизмы производства культурного единства и разнообразия*, in *Фундаментальные проблемы культурологии: Сб. ст. по материалам конгресса*, Д. Л. Спивак (ed.), М.: Новый хронограф: Эйдос, vol. 6, 2009, pp. 56-68. (<http://ec-dejavu.ru/o/Oblivion-2.html>)
53. Нора, П. (1999) *Проблематика мест памяти*, in *Франция - память*, П. Нора et al. (eds), СПб.: Изд-во С.-Петербур. ун-та, pp. 17-50. (<http://ec-dejavu.ru/m-2/Memory-Nora.html>)
54. Штомпка, П. (2000) *Социальное изменение как травма*, in *Социологические исследования*, no.1-2. (<http://ecsocman.edu.ru/images/pubs/2007/05/07/0000307513/1-Shtompka.pdf>).